

## PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

<b>To:</b>	Historic Preservation Commission, Through Philip Rodriguez, City Manager
<b>Prepared By:</b>	Aja Tibbs, Long Range Planner
<b>Date Prepared:</b>	July 26, 2018
<b>Requested Action:</b>	Review at a public hearing and make a recommendation to the City Council for the nomination of the Brighton Train Depot at 269 Bridge Street.

### **PURPOSE:**

In order to proceed with the designation of this property as a historic landmark, the Brighton Historic Preservation Commission (BHPC) shall review the nomination and application for designation as a historic landmark, conduct a public hearing, and approve a nomination resolution to the City Council.

### **BACKGROUND:**

The BHPC received a nomination application to list the Brighton Train Depot, addressed as 269 Bridge Street, as a historic landmark. The owner and applicant of the property is the City of Brighton. The applicant, on behalf of the owner has consented to the nomination of the structure as a historic landmark.

### **HISTORIC LANDMARK ELIGIBILITY:**

An individual property may be designated as a historic landmark if it is at least fifty (50) years old and possesses historic and/or architectural significance. If the property is not at least fifty (50) years old, it must possess exceptional historic and/or architectural significance. The finding of historic and/or architectural significance requires that the property meets at least one (1) of the Eligibility Categories. To meet an Eligibility Category, at least one (1) of the criteria must be satisfied. In order to find that a property possesses exceptional historic and/or architectural significance, it must meet at least two (2) of the following Eligibility Categories:

- 1) Architectural Category: In order to be considered significant in the Architectural Category, at least one (1) of the following criteria must be met:
  - a. exemplifies specific distinguishing characteristics of an architectural period or style;  
or
  - b. is an example of the work of an architect or builder who is recognized for expertise nationally, state-wide, regionally or locally; or
  - c. demonstrates superior craftsmanship or high artistic value; or
  - d. contains elements of architectural design, detail, materials, construction or craftsmanship which represent a significant innovation; or
  - e. evidences a style particularly associated with the Brighton area.

- 2) Social and Historic Category: In order to be considered significant in the Social and Historic Category, at least one (1) of the following criteria must be met:
  - a. is the site of an historic event that had an effect upon society; or
  - b. exemplifies cultural, political, economic or social heritage of the community; or
  - c. represents a built environment of a group of people in an era of history; or
  - d. has significant character, interest or value, as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, State, or nation; or
  - e. has an association with a notable person(s) or the work of a notable person(s).
  
- 3) Geographic and Environmental Category: In order to be considered significant in the Geographic and Environmental Category, at least one (1) of the following criteria must be met:
  - a. enhances a sense of identity of the community; or
  - b. by being part of, or related to, a square, park or other distinctive area which should be developed or preserved according to a plan based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif; or
  - c. is unique in its location of singular physical characteristics; or
  - d. possesses unique and notable historic, cultural or architectural motifs; or
  - e. is an established and familiar mutual setting or visual feature of the community.

#### **ARCHITECTURAL SUMMARY:**

The depot is a one-story wood rectangular clapboard building on a stone foundation, with a shed-roof addition on the south and a boxcar painted in Union Pacific colors attached on the east. The original depot building was built from a standardized plan for a *combination depot* type. Combination depots were rectangular buildings with the long axis parallel to the tracks. Most were one-story with gable roofs, such as the Brighton Depot. Roof eaves generally had a wide overhang, both for visual effect and functional purpose by providing shade. They nearly always had three rooms: a passenger waiting room at one end, a central office for train operations, and a freight-baggage-express package room at the other end.

For textural interest on the simple depot, there are two types of siding: vertical beadboard beneath the window sills, and horizontal clapboards above. As is typical of combination depots, this building has a gable roof with widely overhanging eaves supported by slightly curved brackets and an open cross-braced spandrel-like bargeboard in each gable end. The large bay window is located close to the center of the trackside of the depot. The bay corresponded on the interior with the central office, and provided the station agent with an unobstructed view of the main track in either direction. This bay has a lower cross gable roof, also with widely overhanging eaves supported by slightly curved brackets and an open cross-braced spandrel-like bargeboard. The majority of the original windows are two-over-two double-hung wood; there are two on the north elevation, two on the west elevation, and four in the office bay. There are also two small two-over-two attic level windows on each gable end, and two small one-over-one windows on the east elevation. There are two historic four-paneled wood doors with transoms flanking either side of the office bay, and a non-historic

door (in original door opening) on the east. These doors have steps with wrought iron railings set on a stone wall. A non-historic glass main entry door is located on the south greenhouse addition. This addition has a stone wall beneath the window sills, and a solid grouping of single sash windows above.

A Burlington-Northern boxcar (painted in Union Pacific colors) is attached on the south end of the east elevation. It has a very shallow gable roof, one window on the east, and attached ladder on the northeast corner.

### **CULTURAL SUMMARY:**

In 1907, the Union Pacific depot building was constructed along Cabbage Avenue, so named due to the numerous cabbage loading docks along Second Avenue. It was the third depot building in Brighton, with the first built in 1870 (originally called "Hughes Station), followed by another in 1882.

The combination depot building was used as both a passenger and freight depot between Brighton and Denver, as well as for the rail traffic north to Greeley and Cheyenne, Wyoming from 1907 until 1964 when passenger services were discontinued along the line. Prior to 1964, public gatherings and meetings were common at the depot in the early part of the twentieth century, such as city-wide festivals. On July 10, 1915, the Liberty Bell passed through Brighton on its way to San Francisco for an exhibition, attracting 1,000 to 1,500 people at the depot which was decorated with flags and bunting. After passenger service was discontinued, it housed offices for two employees assigned to freight depot control between Commerce City and Greeley from 1964 through 1980. In 1980, the Union Pacific gave the depot to the City of Brighton, which then transferred ownership to private owners. In 1981, it was moved by Howard Eyerly to 269 Bridge Street, on the opposite side of the tracks from its original location. A greenhouse addition was built on the south gable end of the building, featuring a shed roof and upper walls of glass. It first housed a restaurant in its new location, and later a bicycle sales and repair shop. The property was sold back to the City this year and is currently vacant.

### **PUBLIC INQUIRIES AND INPUT:**

Notice of the public hearing, regarding the nomination of the Brighton Train Depot, was published in the *Brighton Standard Blade* and posted on the property for no less than fifteen (15) days prior to the date of the public hearing. As of the date this report was published, the Historic Preservation Administrator has not received any formal public inquiries or input regarding this project.

### **STAFF ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION:**

The Brighton Train Depot was built in 1907 and is more than 50 years old. Therefore, Section 17-52-40 of the *Brighton Municipal Code* requires that at least one criteria under one of the three Eligibility Categories be met. In consideration of the architectural and cultural history listed above, staff finds the application for designation is meeting the following criteria (*justification has been provided in bold below each criteria*):

- 4) Architectural Category: In order to be considered significant in the Architectural Category, at least one (1) of the following criteria must be met:
- a. **exemplifies specific distinguishing characteristics of an architectural period or style; or**  
*The style and shape of the depot identifies with train transportation dependency in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century*
  - c. **demonstrates superior craftsmanship or high artistic value; or**  
*The depot's gable roof with wide overhanging eaves, bracket detailing, exterior paneling, rail-oriented bay window, and original wood windows and doors all contain craftsmanship and artistic value that is rare within Brighton*
- 5) Social and Historic Category: In order to be considered significant in the Social and Historic Category, at least one (1) of the following criteria must be met:
- a. **is the site of an historic event that had an effect upon society; or**  
*Most early public meetings and gatherings. Most notably, the liberty bell tour visit on July 10, 2015*
  - c. **exemplifies cultural, political, economic or social heritage of the community;**  
*Iconic building demonstrating the way of life for the early Brighton community*
  - e. **has significant character, interest or value, as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, State, or nation; or**  
*Train depots provided access and transportation and was the primary source leading to the town's early development*
- 6) Geographic and Environmental Category: In order to be considered significant in the Geographic and Environmental Category, at least one (1) of the following criteria must be met:
- a. **enhances a sense of identity of the community; or**  
*Preserves an icon within the community crucial to Brighton's early development*
  - e. **is an established and familiar mutual setting or visual feature of the community.**  
*A well-known and established part of the community*

As listed above, staff finds that the significance of this structure is primarily met through the Social and Historic Category. However, significance can be found in all three categories as an established community landmark with exceptional architectural integrity. In order to retain significance, care to preserve the exterior historic materials and details, original windows and doors, roof form (material exempted) is essential. Additionally, maintaining the depot's current location adjacent to the Union Pacific Railroad helps to provide context despite its relocation in 1981. The southern (greenhouse bay) and eastern (rail car) additions were not completed during the period of significance and are not considered to be historic additions.

#### **POTENTIAL ACTIONS BY THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION:**

The BHPC shall hold the public hearing to review the nomination for designation of a Historic Landmark, and shall make a determination as to the appropriateness of the nomination,

according to the standards and criteria adopted. If the nominated cultural resource is found to possess significance, as determined by the standards and criteria of this Article and rules and regulations, the Commission shall make a recommendation of approval to designate the cultural resource as a Historic Landmark to the City Council. At the close of the public hearing, the Commission shall take one of the following actions:

- Approve the draft Resolution making a recommendation of designation to the City Council.
- Approve the draft Resolution, with specific changes or conditions, making a recommendation of designation to the City Council.
- Continue the public hearing to a date certain, with findings of fact to justify the decision.
- Direct staff to draft a Resolution to recommend denial to the City Council, with specific findings of fact to justify the decision.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

- Application Submittal Items: photographs of the site, and the application questionnaire (specific criteria analysis from the applicant).
- Architectural Inventory Form 5AM.33 (contains site and historic images and maps)
- Resolution (draft)